

The Revolutionary Americas

Try It — Comparing and Contrasting Primary and Secondary Sources on the Topic of the Mexican War for Independence

Criteria for Comparison	Secondary Source #1	Secondary Source #2	Primary Source #1	Primary Source #2
Title of document	Mexican Independence from Spain	Struggle for Mexican Independence	The Cry of Dolores	Spirits of Moctezuma... Take Pride
Date document created	Unknown	Unknown	September 16, 1810	September 14, 1813
Author of document	Unknown - Public Broadcasting Website	Unknown – History.com website	Miguel Hidalgo y Costilla	Jose Maria Morelos
Purpose/Audience of document	To inform the reader about how Mexico gained its independence from Spain.	To inform the reader about how Mexico gained its independence from Spain.	To rally the people to fight for independence from Spain.	To provide a justification for self-rule and the stated goal of protecting the rights of the people, cultural institutions and religion.
Author's Point of View	Author objectively outlines the main facts of the Mexican War for Independence.	Author objectively outlines the main facts of the Mexican War for Independence.	The rebellion is a just cause with god on their side.	The biblical reference to Israelites implies god is on their side; and that this is a just cause that will be won.

Criteria for Comparison	Secondary Source #1	Secondary Source #2	Primary Source #1	Primary Source #2
<p>Information that is similar to other sources (corroborated information)</p>	<p>On September 16, 1810, the priest Miguel Hidalgo y Costilla urged the Mexicans to fight for independence from Spain.</p> <p>The revolution was led by Creoles or Spaniards born in Mexico who were treated as second class citizens compared to the Spaniards born in Spain.</p> <p>The revolution was supported by the native people and Mestizos (people of native and Spanish heritage).</p> <p>The Mexican Revolution was from 1810 to 1821.</p>	<p>On September 16, 1810, the priest Miguel Hidalgo y Costilla urged the Mexicans to fight for independence from Spain in a speech known as “Grito de Dolores.”</p> <p>The revolution was led by Creoles or Spaniards born in Mexico who were treated as second class citizens compared to the Spaniards born in Spain</p> <p>The revolution was supported by the native people and Mestizos (people of native and Spanish heritage).</p> <p>The Mexican Revolution was from 1810 to 1821.</p>	<p>On September 16, 1810, Miguel Hidalgo y Costilla made the speech known as the Cry of Dolores in which he called for the people to join him in the fight for independence from Spain.</p> <p>From the speech it can be inferred that Hidalgo led a militia to fight the Spanish as stated in Secondary Source #2.</p>	<p>The author makes reference to the town of Dolores, which can be inferred as Hidalgo’s Cry of Dolores Speech.</p> <p>He acknowledges the leadership of Hidalgo.</p> <p>Morelos is mentioned as a revolutionary leader in Secondary Source #2.</p>
<p>Information that is different from other sources</p>	<p>Hidalgo ordered the arrest of the Spaniards living in the village of Dolores before he made his “El Grito” speech.</p>	<p>In addition to a cry for independence, Grito de Dolores called for the redistribution of land and racial equality.</p>	<p>From the speech it can be inferred that Hidalgo led a militia to fight the Spanish as stated in Secondary Source #2.</p>	<p>Many other revolutionary leaders were mentioned that were not in the other sources.</p>

Criteria for Comparison	Secondary Source #1	Secondary Source #2	Primary Source #1	Primary Source #2
	<p>No one really knows for certain what Hidalgo said in this his “El Grito” speech.</p> <p>The Creoles opposed the French rule of Napoleon’s brother Joseph Bonapart (King of Spain).</p> <p>The Creoles were conservative and opposed the liberal ideas originating from France and the United States.</p> <p>Sept. 15 and 16 are celebrated as Mexico’s Independence Day.</p>	<p>Hidalgo led a militia from village to village until he was defeated in January 1811 and was captured and executed.</p> <p>Morelos, Matamoros and Gurerrero continued to lead armies against the Spanish loyalists until they gained their independence in 1821 with the Treaty of Cordoba, establishing Mexico as an independent monarchy.</p> <p>By 1823, Antonio Lopez de Santa Anna and Gudalupe Victoria established the first Mexican Republic.</p> <p>Sept. 16 is celebrated as Mexico’s Independence Day.</p>		